

# Sustainable Development Goal 4: A Legislative and Policy Gap Analysis for Balochistan

4 QUALITY  
EDUCATION





# Sustainable Development Goal 4: A Legislative and Policy Gap Analysis for Balochistan

OCTOBER 2017



Aurat Publication and Information Service  
Foundation (Aurat Foundation)



## Sustainable Development Goal 4

Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all.

### Disclaimer:

The views expressed in this publication are those of the author(s)—and the respondents interviewed during the research of which this report is a product—and do not necessarily represent those of the United Nations, including UNDP, or UN Member States.”

[www.pk.undp.org](http://www.pk.undp.org)

United Nations Development Programme Pakistan  
4th Floor, Serena Business Complex,  
Khayaban-e-Suharwardy,  
Sector G-5/1, P.O. Box 1051,  
Islamabad, Pakistan.



This report has been produced with technical and financial support from UNDP and UKaid in Pakistan

Research conducted and report produced by:  
Aurat Foundation

Design & Print: Agha Jee Printers

## Acknowledgements

This research is carried out by a team, put together by Aurat Foundation (AF). For team composition, roles and responsibilities please see Annex – 7.

First of all, the research team would like to thank participants who took time to meet the members of the research team to share their views during the FGD, KIIs and provincial consultation meeting in Quetta. Their contribution and guidance is greatly appreciated.

Special thanks are due to Mr. Karim Gabol, Project Officer (Parliament) and Mr. James Littleton, Chief Technical Advisor, both from Strengthening Electoral & Legislative Process (SELP), Democratic Governance Unit, UNDP Pakistan for their valuable input at all stages of this research. In particular, Mr. Gabol contributed greatly to the report quality by reviewing the draft report and providing his constructive comments.

The guidance and advice extended from Mr. Naeem Mirza and Mr. Younas Khalid from Aurat Foundation for this research is acknowledged with thanks. The entire administrative and coordination support extended from Uzma Zarrin and Haroon Dawood from Aurat Foundation is highly appreciated in terms of timely delivery of all key milestones of this short term project of UNDP and Aurat Foundation.

## Executive Summary

This report encapsulates the findings, analysis, conclusions and recommendations of the review of legislative and policy gap analysis focusing on Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 4 in Balochistan. The SDGs stemmed from the MDGs as the post-2015 Development Agenda after MDGs came to an end in 2015.

UNDP commissioned a legislative and policy gap analysis to the Aurat Foundation as part of its initiatives to engage civil society organisations (CSOs) under its Strengthening Electoral and Legislative Processes (SELP) Project. The aim of this report is to evaluate the potential for localising SDG 4 and its targets. The main purpose is to understand, assess and overcome the challenges hindering the achievement of SDG 4 in the province and support members of the provincial parliament to understand existing legislative and policy framework relevant to SDG 4 and its targets.

The United Nations General Assembly adopted the 2030 Development Agenda of “Transforming Our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development” outlining 17 SDGs comprised of 169 targets. In February 2016, the National Assembly of Pakistan adopted the 2030 Agenda and SDGs as the national development agenda after unanimously passing a resolution. The federal and provincial governments have also committed to setting up SDG Support Units and additional financial resources for mainstreaming the SDGs in policies and plans, data & reporting, an inclusive budgeting process and tracking expenditure and innovation.

Vision 2025 puts education at the forefront of its human development agenda and aims to push public expenditure on education to 4% of the country's GDP by 2018 from its current level of 2%. Vision 2025 underpins developing human and social capital as a long-term and comprehensive strategy to achieve sustainable development. It also offers a holistic approach to overcome human and social development gaps.

This research mainly adopts a qualitative approach to understand the legislative and policy environment surrounding the education sector in Balochistan and how the legislation and policies can be linked with SDG 4 targets. The methodological approach includes, reviewing the available literature, developing research tools, i.e. interview guidelines for focus group discussions and key informant interviews as well as for group meetings.

A target wise analysis of the key findings of the policy review presents the following;

- Target 4.1, which is related to ensuring free education for girls and boys, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes, finds gaps in the existing legislation and policy provisions focussing on quality aspects in primary and secondary education. The legislation also needs to fill these gaps on alternative modes of learning for out of school children and adolescents and take care of the regulation of madrassa schools.
- Target 4.2, stipulates that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and primary education so that they are ready for primary education, finds some gaps in terms of policy and legislation. Being absent altogether, the component of early childhood development and care requires comprehensive legislation according to the age of children from pre primary to various stepwise grades in primary education. At policy level, the entire focus needs to be shifted from Early Childhood Education to comprehensive early childhood development, care and education. Guidance therefore should be taken from the Draft Provincial School Education Policy of Balochistan which aims to “prepare strong foundations for children through effective early childhood care and development”.

- Target 4.3, indicating progress towards ensuring equal access for all women and men to affordable quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university, sets its benchmark as the TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 as well as Vision 2025. There are opportunities for Balochistan to take advantage of renewed support for TVET in Vision 2025. As per the Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) the higher/tertiary education, particularly university education, is not covered by any provincial legislation or policy directives. The policy needs to devise clear inter-departmental coordination mechanisms within the province or at federal level as well as with private sector organisations. Besides this, the fee and affordability is another area where legislation or policy must establish clarity to achieve progress under SDG 4, target 4.3.
- Target 4.4, envisaging ensuring that all youths and adults have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent work and entrepreneurship finds some positive policy backing in the shape of Skills for Growth & Development, A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 and the Balochistan Youth Policy 2015. The policy perspectives, however need to be reviewed especially in the context of CPEC and associated skill set requirements. The legislators in the province may consider strengthening existing provincial legislation on TEVTA to provide policy guidance linking policies with SDG 4, target 4.4. Policy for B-TEVTA also needs to be formulated covering missing aspects of developing coordination and partnership between the public and private sector. The existing set of good policies including Pakistan Vision 2025, Skills for Growth & Development, the TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 and The National Skills Strategy 2009-2013 can be the best directive for provincial legislation around SDG 4, target 4.4.
- Target 4.5, focusing on eliminating gender disparities in education and ensuring equal education to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations. This research found to have implementation gaps for having no legislative and policy direction to promote distance learning and use of ICT to facilitate learning in conflict zone and remote areas. The remote and scattered geography of Balochistan demands a thorough focus on promoting the use of ICT and distance learning.
- Target 4.6, putting its direct focus to ensure that all youths and adults, both men and women, reach a proficiency level in literacy and numeracy sufficient to fully participate in society needs legislative attention which covers provision of literacy and numeracy skills for youth and adults. There is an inadequate policy focus as in BESP 2013-18. Adult/functional literacy and numeracy skills need to be integrated urgently into existing or new legislative and policy provisions where the existing national policy provisions (such as National Education Policy 2009 and The National Curriculum for Literacy: Functional Literacy and Income Generating Skills 2007) may serve as guiding documents to inform provincial legislation and policy to have targeted progress around SDG 4, target 4.6.
- Target 4.7, has its focus on ensuring that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development. The National Education Policy 2009, recommends reforming the curriculum by introducing fundamental rights, environmental education, school health, life skills based education, education against HIV/AIDS and other infectious diseases, school safety, disaster and risk management, peace education and inter-faith harmony. There is no legislative or policy provision covering ESD and GCED themes. There is a need to review and revise the provincial legislation and policies to bring them in line with SDG 4, target 4.7, in terms of introducing global citizenship, human rights, peace and harmonisation, appreciating culture and cultural diversity and its contribution to sustainable development.
- Targets 4a, 4b and 4c, being means of implementation, raise attention on related challenges such as resource allocation, further developing existing practices such as increased utilisation of existing schools as non formal and community learning centres, integrating education of persons with disabilities and other vulnerabilities like disaster, safety and security of schools and violence-free schools.

# Table of Contents

Executive Summary	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Table of Contents	iv
Abbreviations & Acronyms	v
Glossary of Terms	vi
Introduction	01
1.1 Background	01
1.2 Context	02
1.3 Aims and Objectives	03
1.4 Methodology	04
1.4.1 Reviewing Available Literature	04
1.4.2 Research Tools	04
Localising SDG 4 in Balochistan	06
2.1 Free, Equitable and Quality Education	06
2.2 Quality Early Childhood Development, Care and Pre-primary Education	11
2.3 Equal Access to Affordable, Quality Technical, Vocational and Tertiary Education	14
2.4 Skills for Decent Work and Entrepreneurship for Youths and Adults	16
2.5 Elimination of Gender Disparities and Discrimination	18
2.6 Literacy and Numeracy for Youths and Adults	20
2.7 Knowledge and Skills for Sustainable Development	22
2.8 Building and Upgrading Education Facilities	23
2.9 International Scholarships in Tertiary Education	24
2.10 Training of Teachers	25
Bibliography	27
Annex 1 – List of Key Legislation and Policy Documents Reviewed	28
Annex 2 – Interview Guidelines	29
Annex 3 – Participants' Cluster Details	31
Annex 4 – List of FGD Participants	32
Annex 5 – List of Key Informants	33
Annex 6 – List of Participants - Provincial Consultative Meeting	34
Annex 7 – Members of Research Team	35
Annex 8 – SDG 4 Targets	36



## Abbreviations & Acronyms

ALP	Alternative Learning Path
ARC	American Refugee Council
ASER	Annual Status of Education Report
BEF	Balochistan Education Foundation
BESP	Balochistan Education Sector Plan
BISP	Benazir Income Support Programme
BOC	Bureau of Curriculum and Extension Centre
BTBB	Balochistan Textbook Board
B-TVETA	Balochistan Technical and Vocation Education Training Academy
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
CSOs	Civil Society Organisations
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
ECCE	Early Childhood Care and Education
ECD	Early Childhood Development
ECE	Early Childhood Education
EDO	Executive District Officer
EFA	Education for All
ESD	Education for Sustainable Development
ESP	Education Sector Plan
FFA	Framework for Action
FGDs	Focus Group Discussions
GCED	Global Citizenship Education
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GoB	Government of Balochistan
GoP	Government of Pakistan
HEC	Higher Education Commission
ICT	Information & Communication Technology
IDPs	Internally Displaced Peoples
ITA	Idara-e-Taleem-o-Aagahi
KIIs	Key Informants Interviews
LEAD	Leadership for Environment and Development
LG	Local Government
MD	Managing Director
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
NAVTEC	National Vocational and Technical Education Commission
NEF	National Education Foundation
NFBE	Non-Formal Basic Education
NVQF	National Vocational Quality Framework
P&D	Planning & Development
PCE	Pakistan Coalition for Education

PCSW	Provincial Commission on the Status of Women
PITE	Provincial Institute for Teacher Education
PPIU	Policy Planning and Implementation Unit
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
SCSPEB	Society for Community Support in Primary Education Balochistan
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
TEVT	Technical Education and Vocational Training
TEVTA	Technical Education & Vocational Training Authority
ToRs	Terms of References
TRSP	TEVT Reform Support Programme
TRSP	TVET Reform Support Programme
UN	United Nations
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
YAL	Youth/Adult Literacy

## Glossary of Terms

Madrassas	Religious seminary
'kachi'	Traditional pre-primary class

## Introduction

This report is intended to provide impetus to the efforts of supporting and informing legislators and parliamentary bodies to understand, analyse, assess and overcome the challenges hindering the achievement of SDG 4 in the province of Balochistan. It is part of the initiatives from the UNDP to engage civil society organisations (CSOs) in Balochistan for legislative/policy review and gap analysis on SDG4 under its Strengthening Electoral and Legislative Processes Project.

### 1.1 Background

In September 2015, 193 members of the UN General Assembly adopted the 2030 Development Agenda of “Transforming Our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development” outlining 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) comprised of 169 targets (ITA 2016). These goals and targets, characterised as the ‘new universal agenda’, are well integrated and address economic, social and environmental dimensions of sustainable development (UN 2015). The SDGs stemmed from the lessons learnt from MDGs as post-2015 Development Agenda after MDGs came to an end in 2015.

Education is at the forefront of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. SDG 4 (Quality Education – Ensuring inclusive and equitable quality education and promoting lifelong learning opportunities for all) is articulated through seven outcome targets and three means of implementation.<sup>1</sup> SDG 4 is articulated after a thorough and extensive consultative process involving governmental and non-governmental development partners and multi-stakeholder deliberations and is a continuation of the unfinished agenda put forward through Education for All (EFA) and Millennium Development Goals (MGDs) initiatives since 2000<sup>2</sup> (UNESCO 2015).

The formulation of SDG 4 underpins three key principles: firstly, that education is a fundamental right; secondly, that education is a public good; and thirdly, that gender equality is closely linked to the right to education for all (UNESCO 2016). SDG 4 promotes education as a universal agenda, ensures lifelong learning opportunities for all, focuses on equity, inclusion and gender equality, aspires for effective learning and stresses relevance of learning. In addition, SDG 4 has broader scope, wider geographical coverage and strong policy focus on equal, universal and quality education across the countries, unlike MDGs and EFA which had a narrower scope, limited geographical coverage and weak policy focus (UNESCO 2016).

In addition to SDG 4, there are other SDGs linked with education such as SDG 3 – Health and Well-being (Target 3.7) and SDG 5 – Gender Equality (Target 5.6) stipulating that information and education should be provided to women for universal access to sexual and reproductive health-care. Other SDGs stress education and training for employment (SDG 8, target 8.6), provision of information and awareness on harmonising lifestyle and sustainable development of nature (SDG 12, target 12.8) and improving education and awareness on issues surrounding climate change (SDG 13, target 13.3).

In 2015, member nation states, including Pakistan, agreed and adopted the “Education 2030 Framework for Action” as a guiding document at the World Education Forum which took place in Incheon, Republic of Korea.

1. For details please see Annex – 8

2. As set out in the vision, rationale and principles of the Education 2030: Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action, World Education Forum 2015.

The document outlines details on agreed commitments and guidance on translating these commitments into actions and practices at national and regional level. The document spells out indicative strategies to help achieve SDG 4 targets by developing a legal and policy framework based on national and regional ground realities.

## 1.2 Context

Pakistan was off-track for achieving universal primary education targets set out under the MGDs, i.e. the predecessor of SDGs. Pakistan managed to achieve only 58% literacy rate against the target of 88%, 58% completion/survival rate: grade 1 to 5 against the target of 100% and 57% net primary enrolment ratio against the target of 100% (LEAD 2015).

Pakistan has the second highest population of out of school children: from 52 million children between the ages of 5 and 16 years, 25 million are out of school (PCE 2015). It is important to note that two important attributes that are instrumental to the SDG 4 i.e. access and quality to education appear to pose ever greater challenges for Pakistan. "The latest Annual Status of Education Report (ASER) tells us that almost half of the 10-year-old students have only achieved the linguistic competence of a 6-year-old in either their mother tongue or in Urdu, the national language. The competency levels for English are abysmal. Only half of 10-year-olds could be tested to be competent in the arithmetic level expected of a 7-year-old. The other halves, not even that 51% of government primary schools do not have electricity. 36% do not have access to clean drinking water. 42% do not have functioning toilets" (PCE 2015, p.14).

Balochistan faces even greater challenges in terms of achieving SDG 4. A large proportion of out of school children, high dropout rates, wide gender disparities in education indicators and poor quality of teaching and learning in the classroom, are some of the main challenges (BESP 2013). More recently, the ASER report highlights that in rural Balochistan, 72% children aged 3-5 years and 33% children aged 6-16 years are out of school (ASER 2015a). Furthermore, in rural areas of Balochistan, only 33% of class 5 students can read a story in Urdu or the regional language, 28% can read sentences in English and 24% can do two-digit divisions in arithmetic as compared to rural Pakistan averages where these figures are 55%, 49% and 50% respectively (ASER 2015).

In line with its international commitments, Pakistan is obliged to deliver on SDG 4. The most important international commitment is the 2030 Development Agenda of "Transforming Our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development" adopted in 2015. In addition, other international commitments such as the Convention on the Rights of the Child (Articles 28 & 29), the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (Article 26), the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Article 13), the UNESCO Convention Against Discrimination in Education, the Dakar Framework for Education (6 goals) are all strongly aligned with SDG 4. The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights also support SDG 4 aims and objectives without any discrimination.

The Constitution of Pakistan 1973 enshrines basic, overarching principles towards a just society with provisions that include (but are not limited to): democratic values; equality for all; freedom from all forms of exploitation and discrimination; special provision for the protection of women and children; and education for all. Article 25A has been specifically inserted in the Constitution and postulates:

'The State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such manner as may be determined by law.'

The 'Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper" (PRSP II) prepared by the Government of Pakistan (GoP) also prioritizes human development with education as a foremost priority. In this regard, the document places particular importance on governance, implementation and monitoring, community involvement, reduced gender disparities and increased financing. The renewed commitment for SDGs in general comes from Pakistan's Vision 2025 One Nation – One Vision, a document formulated after extensive stakeholder consultation at national as well as provincial level. This ambitious document aims to achieve SDGs by 2025 as compared with 2030 deadline set out by the international community. The document aspires to bring Pakistan into the world's 10 top economies (GoP 2014). Vision 2025 puts education at the forefront of its human development agenda and addresses aims to push public expenditure on education to 4% of its GDP by 2018 from its current level of 2%. The document underpins developing human and social capital as a long-term and comprehensive strategy to achieve sustainable development. It also offers a holistic approach to overcome human and social development gaps (Siddiqi 2016).

Since the enactment of the 18th Constitutional Amendment in 2010, all provincial legislators including legislators from Balochistan are responsible for devising laws and policies on education in the province. The 18th Amendment is intended to provide more autonomy to the provinces and also offers a 'new governance paradigm', where more participatory and collaborative development planning and implementation can be possible while involving federal and provincial government departments, ministries, the private sector and civil society to work together for a shared goal (GoP 2014).

In February 2016, the National Assembly of Pakistan adopted the 2030 Agenda and SDGs as the national development agenda after unanimously passing a resolution. The federal and provincial governments have also committed setting up SDG Support Units and additional financial resources for mainstreaming the SDGs in policies and plans, data & reporting, inclusive budgeting process & tracking expenditure and innovation (UNDG 2016).

Furthermore, the Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) was developed in 2013 in line with Article 25A of the constitution of Pakistan and achieving the goals of the Millennium Development Goals (MGDs) and Education for All (EFA) on the international agenda after an extensive consultative process. BESP used the National Education Policy 2009 as a guiding principle and it was developed as a flexible and live document that can be reviewed and updated to assess and incorporate future needs (PPIU 2013).

### 1.3 Aims and Objectives

The main purpose of this report is to determine the extent to which existing legislative provisions support the successful realisation of SDG 4 targets in Balochistan province. This report outlines an overview of the relevance of existing legislation, policies and plans associated with the SDG 4 and its targets. This report also ascertains legislative and policy provisions needed to successfully achieve SDG 4 targets. Thus, the purpose of this report is to identify gaps between what provisions are there and what more are needed to effectively realise the SDG 4 and its targets.

More specifically, the following are the main objectives as stipulated in the REF. This report will:

- provide legislatures with knowledge about the existing legislative provisions covering the Sustainable Development Goal 4.
- carry out an analysis of the implications of weak laws or their absence.
- make recommendations for legislative reforms within the sectoral framework of the SDGs.
- offer an insight into new legislative requirements and the provincial level necessary for the progress towards the SDGs.

## 1.4 Methodology

This research mainly adopts a qualitative approach to understand the legislative and policy environment surrounding the education sector in Balochistan and how this legislation and these policies can be linked with SDG 4 targets. Qualitative research offers an iterative process with the flexibility to adjust or rearrange questions based on the situation. It offers description and explanation of the responses as opposed to just quantifying variations in a quantitative approach. With each response (or interview/discussion) knowledge and understanding on the issue expands on an incremental basis. A brief description of the methodological approach and research tools is presented below.

### 1.4.1 Reviewing Available Literature

The study commenced with a comprehensive law and policy review to understand the policy environment and context. As an initial step, existing legislation, policies and plans were reviewed in line with the broader Education 2030 Framework for Action. The literature review includes national and provincial laws and policies relevant to education as well as the provincial education sector plan (ESP), SDG related documents, articles, reports, analysis and plans. A list of key legislation and policy documents reviewed is given in Annex – 1.

### 1.4.2 Research Tools

Semi-structured interview guidelines (see Annex – 2) were developed around SDG 4 targets to carry out discussions, interviews and meeting with key stakeholders in the province. The research design is based on gathering data and information from stakeholders from a range of backgrounds and strands within the education sector.

#### a. Focus Group Discussion (FGDs)

In total, three Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) were planned initially, with key stakeholders from three clusters and are outlined in Annex – 3.

However, after the first FGD took place, it was felt that FGDs appeared to pose more challenges than producing useful discussion and information. First of all, it proved to be difficult to attract participants with relevant knowledge, skills and understanding of their sectors in terms of legislation/policy interventions. Key participants, who were invited, did not turn up and nominated someone else without much understanding of the sector/department. In addition, since the research primarily focuses on SDG 4, which includes primary, secondary, tertiary and technical/vocational education, it has proved difficult to engage participants from various departments with knowledge and understanding about the legislation, policies and plans in their own sector and not other sectors. This has resulted in either participants interrupting others or becoming disinterested in the discussions.

Based on this experience, it was decided, in consultation with the team, to focus on relevant key contacts and carry out Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) at their workplace based on their convenience and availability. The number of KIIs was thus increased to 16, and attempts have been made to involve key staff members from all stakeholders with the right set of skills, knowledge and experience in the education sector.

Thus, in total, 1 FGD and 16 KIIs were conducted as compared to the proposed 3 FGDs. The list of FGD participants is presented as Annex – 4.

b. Key Informant Interviews (KIIs)

Initially, 8 KIIs were planned; however, due to the changes discussed pertaining to the variation in the FGDs above, 16 KIIs were conducted. A list of the participants took part in the KIIs is presented as Annex – 5.

c. Provincial Consultative Workshop

A one-day provincial consultative workshop was organised in Quetta. The purpose was to present preliminary findings from FGDs and KIIs and seek further information, comments and recommendations from the participants. Representatives from the above-stated clusters for FGDs were invited for this consultative workshop (please see Annex – 6, for the list of participants).

## Localising SDG 4 in Balochistan

This section presents key findings and analysis on the existing legislative provisions and policy framework in Balochistan pertaining to SDG 4, its seven targets and three means of implementation. The key findings are drawn from secondary and primary sources. The secondary sources include reviewing available literature review on the subject matter as well as legislation provisions currently in place or at formulation stage i.e. available in draft form. The primary sources include Focus Group Discussion (FGD) with a wide range of stakeholders/sector actors and Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) with officials in key government departments as well as UN agencies. The findings and analysis also derive from the workshop conducted at the end of fieldwork to share preliminary findings and seek guidance, direction and recommendation to make the process more inclusive and participatory. All participants who took part in the FGD and KIIs were brought together for the provincial consultative workshop.

The section is structured around seven targets and three means of implementation as specified by the SDG 4. The purpose here is to contextualise and link each target with the existing legal and policy provisions and to identify gaps. The Education 2030 Framework for Action (FFA) developed after an extensive consultative process, agreed upon and adopted at the World Education Forum in 2015 and used as a guiding document. The Framework for Action (FFA) offers an opportunity to implement, coordinate, finance and review the 2030 Education Agenda at all levels (UNESCO 2015). The SDG 4 targets are universal, however, Governments are expected to realise these global targets in line with their national education systems, policies, priorities, development strategies and available resources.

### 2.1 Free, Equitable and Quality Education

By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes (Target 4.1)

The first SDG 4 target requires Balochistan to put legislation in place to guarantee 12 years of free (at least nine years of compulsory), publicly funded, inclusive, equitable and quality primary and secondary education in the province. The 12 years (with nine years compulsory) primary and secondary education should be available for all without any discrimination and cost barriers.

In order to fully achieve SDG 4 target 4.1, legislative provision should be able to guide the education policies and address the following attributes to promote quality education.

- Curriculum & textbooks – Standardise and review curricula to ensure quality and relevance
- Assessment – More robust, comprehensive assessment systems to assess learning outcomes
- Leadership and Governance – Strengthen institutions, school leadership, and governance
- Multi-lingual education – In Balochistan's context, early learning in first or home language of children
- Alternative Learning for Out of School Children – Alternative modes of learning and education for out of school children and adolescents



## Findings and Analysis

There exist a number of legislative and policy provisions in Balochistan province relevant to the SDG 4, Target 4.1.

Relevant Legislation	Relevant Policies/Plans
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014</li> <li>• The Balochistan Introduction of Mother Languages as Compulsory Subject at Primary Level Act, 2014</li> <li>• The Balochistan Child Protection Act, 2016</li> <li>• Draft Balochistan Private Educational Institutions Registration, Regulation and Promotion Act 2016</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP)</li> <li>• Draft Provincial School Education Policy of Balochistan</li> <li>• Standard Operating Procedures for Curriculum and Textbook Development –Balochistan</li> </ul>

The Balochistan Child Protection Act, 2016 considers denying children's educational needs by neglecting attending school as a form of mental violence and against the best interest of a child. However, the existing legislative provision of [The Balochistan Compulsory Education Bill, 2014](#) that was enacted in February 2014 and became an Act is the cornerstone advocating free and compulsory education for children, both boys and girls, between the ages of 5 and 16 years. The Act is closely synchronised with Article 25A of the Constitution of Islamabad Republic of Pakistan 1973 postulating that:

“The State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such manner as may be determined by law.”

The Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014 provides the following important definitions to elaborate the Act and put the provision under this Act into perspective and effectively link it to the SDG 4, Target 4.1:

Child – [means a child of either sex whose age at the beginning of the school year is not less than five years and not more than sixteen years]

Education – [means the education pertaining to all or any of the class I to X in a school, or a minimum quality as per prescribed standards]

Free Education – [means that the state shall charge no fee for tuition either directly or through any other head that imposes a financial burden on the parent/guardian of the child and the state shall provide the child with free textbooks, stationery, one meal in school and transport facilities]

The definitions clarify some of the important issues highlighted by the SDG 4, Target 4.1. The SDG 4, Target 4.1 requires the Balochistan Government to ensure 12 years (with nine years compulsory) of free, compulsory and inclusive primary and secondary education to all children (both boys and girls). Target 4.1 also emphasises quality aspects with relevant and effective outcomes.

A closer look at the Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014 reveals that the Act advocates ten years of free and compulsory education i.e. primary grade 1 – 5, middle grade 6 – 8 and secondary grades 9 – 10. However, higher secondary education is not included in the Bill.

The Act can be scrutinised from two different standpoints to evaluate whether it is aligned with SDG 4, Target 4.1. Firstly, it paints an encouraging picture in terms of the amount of free and compulsory education. The SDG

4, Target 4.1 anticipates at least nine years of compulsory education while the Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014 supports ten years of compulsory education. Secondly, the SDG 4, Target 4.1 campaigns for 12 years of free education, while the Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014 only backs ten years of free education, indicating a potential gap in the legislative provision. One of the key informants during interviews recognised it as a potential discrepancy and pointed out:

“The SDG 4 talks about 12 years of free education but our sector plan, legislation and policies advocate 10 years of free education. However, if we are to increase free education from 10 to 12, we really have to do a financial analysis and see how much more resources are required to meet this provision. We feel that the SDG 4 agenda is idealistic and in order to make it realistic we have to look at our policies, context and available financial resources to ensure that we could do it for all boys and girls with support from federal government as well as other development partners.”

However, the Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014 does not address quality aspects as specified in the SDG 4, Target 4.1, which highlights quality as an important attribute and links it to relevant and effective learning outcomes. Instead, the Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) is a useful policy document that addresses quality aspects through determinants of curriculum, textbooks, teachers, assessments and school environment. The BESP shifts the focus of education from access to quality improvements in classroom teaching and learning. In addition, BESP also promotes school language (first or home language) as an approach to the quality and relevance, particularly in primary education in the province. The BESP is considered as another legal cover for literacy in the province after the Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014. As one key informant, appreciating the usefulness of the BESP articulated:

“We feel that Baluchistan province is fortunate to have developed an education sector plan, which is a five year plan covering five thematic areas which are also part of SDG 4 e.g. quality and relevance of education, access and equity, governance and management, higher education and non-formal education/adult literacy/TEVT. We participated in a national level consultative workshop lately to ascertain if our education sector plan is in line with SDG 4 and we found out that the sector plan support approximately 70% of the SDG 4 targets.”

The BESP targets improvement of quality of education through a shift towards higher order thinking and looking to see a 5% increase in student learning outcomes by 2017. The BESP envisages quality improvement through development standards and measureable benchmarks, linked approaches in teaching and learning, capacity development of managers and teachers, examiners, curriculum and textbook board officials, creating a learner-teacher friendly environment and language policy conducive to learning. These quality improvements are directed towards SDG 4, target 4.1 quality requirements of curriculum, assessment, leadership & governance and multi-lingual education in Balochistan. There appear to be a wider recognition within the province on the quality aspects. During interviews and discussions one participant translated SDG 4 quality requirements as:

“SDG 4 has a specific focus on quality education. Although we are imparting education to our children, however, we need to closely evaluate quality aspects to understand what exactly are the quality attributes and how can we meet quality standards?”

The recognition of quality attributes and standards is commendable however; achieving quality standards is proved to be a greater challenge. As one key informant highlighted:

“We have developed and adopted minimum education standards at national level but there is a real need to implement these minimum education standards. Even today in our province, we have more than 50 percent single-teacher schools. So how do we ensure quality in situation like these where there is only one teacher? If we recruit another teacher, we need to see if we have financial resources and space to accommodate one extra teacher. There are many schools where there is no science lab and library, so how will we improve quality in schools like these?”

Another policy document prepared to provide a roadmap towards quality education is the Draft Provincial School Education Policy Balochistan linking children cognitive ability, teaching-learning and assessment as well as the school environment conducive to learning as some determinants of quality education. This policy promises development and improvements in standards, teachers training, textbooks, assessment, curriculum, language, physical infrastructure and governance and management. The policy also highlights inclusivity, girls' education and multiple options to increase access to primary and secondary education. The Standard Operating Procedures for Curriculum and Textbook Development – Balochistan were developed in 2013 to take on the devolved responsibility assigned under the 18th constitutional amendment. The purpose was to review textbooks, the development of curriculum and quality textbooks involving the Bureau of Curriculum and Extension Centre (BOC) Quetta and Balochistan Textbook Board (BTBB).

The Balochistan Introduction of Mother Languages as Compulsory Additional Subject at Primary Level Act, 2014, is a provision that only suggests introducing the mother tongue as a compulsory additional subject at primary level in the province and does not promise multi-lingual education in first (mother tongue) or home language. Thus, it is not aligned with SDG 4, target 4.1.

There are some policy provisions on alternative modes of learning for out of school and adolescents offering directions on setting up non-formal schools, community schools and community support processes to bring back school children into the formal education system. However, there is no legislation guiding the policy formulation on this issue.

It is imperative to note that there is a massive expansion in private sector schools in the province, particularly in urban centres (PPIU 2013). In addition, madrassas are also imparting education to a large number of students in the province. Recently, efforts have been made to bring private sector into a regulatory framework through Balochistan Private Educational Institutions Registration, Regulation and Promotion Act 2016.

The Act (i.e. Balochistan Private Educational Institutions Registration, Regulation and Promotion Act 2016) requires all private sector schools to comply with the curriculum, courses, textbooks, assessment and examination system approved by the Government of Balochistan. However, it is not mandatory for madrassas to register under this Act and it offers an option to register voluntarily.

The stakeholders of the consultative workshop reinforced the implementation of Article 25 A as per the constitution of Pakistan where the Govt of Balochistan should review and emend the related policy and legal frameworks and ensure its implementation in true letter and spirits.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

Below are the conclusions drawn from the secondary sources as well as the discussions that took place with key informants and participants in the FGD. Both primary and secondary sources identified potential weaknesses and gaps in streamlining existing legislative and policy provisions with SDG 4, target 4.1. These gaps are outlined here:

- The existing legislative and policy provisions cover only ten years of free and compulsory education and not twelve years as stipulated in the SDG 4, target 4.1. Higher secondary school education is not included in the existing provisions.
- Govt of Balochistan must provide free and compulsory education to every child (boy and girl) thus materialise the Article 25 A implementation.
- The existing legislation is more about access/provision and not about the quality of education. However, policy provisions (e.g. BESP) consider quality as a critical, essential and important parameter along with access and provision to primary and secondary education. The SDG 4, target 4.1 clearly underlines provision of quality education as an essential element.
- The legislation only requires mother tongue to be added as an additional subject in schools at primary levels and does not seek to promote multilingual or mother tongue to be used as the language of instruction as advocated by the SDG 4, target 4.1. However, policy documents propose adopting the mother tongue as a language of instructions.
- The legislation does not clearly address alternative modes of learning for out of school children and adolescents. However, the policies outline non-formal, community schools and fast track Alternative Learning Path (ALP) provisions through the Balochistan Education Foundation (BEF) and the National Education Foundation (NEF).
- The private sector schools are brought into a regulatory framework under the Balochistan Private Educational Institutions Registration, Regulation and Promotion Act 2016, however, madrassas are given an option to register under this Act on a voluntary basis, thus keeping madrassas out of the regulatory framework with implications for quality parameters.

The legislative and policy gaps identified above have implications in terms of achieving SDG 4, target 4.1. These gaps could slow down the progress towards achieving broader SDG 4 goals and objectives and could hold back the province to accomplish the 2030 Agenda and SDGs as well as the national development agenda of Pakistan. In addition, since the central policy provision of BESP was developed in 2013, it should also be streamlined with the SDG 4 targets. There is also a need to synchronised legislation with policy provisions which requires amending existing legislative and policy provisions. More specifically, to address the gaps in legislative and policy provisions, below are the recommendations:

- There is a need to amend existing legislation to include the higher secondary education in line with SDG 4, target 4.1 i.e. free 12-year education as agreed and prescribed in the Education 2030 Framework for Action (FFA).
- The legislative provision should include quality parameters to clearly guide and closely align policies with SDG 4, target 4.1.

- The legislation should be amended to include the use of mother tongue, first or home language to be used as the language of instruction in primary schools to harness cognitive development of children in the province.
- More robust legislation and policy provision should be proposed for alternative modes of learning for out of school children and adolescents.
- There is a need to introduce or amend existing legislation to promote a regulatory framework with a focus on quality education for private schools. All religious seminaries or madrassas that are offering formal education/certification should be brought under the legislative provision.

## 2.2 Quality Early Childhood Development, Care and Pre-primary Education

By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education (Target 4.2)

Early childhood Care and Education (ECCE) is critical to long-term development, wellbeing, health and preparing children to start their schooling. ECCE also “includes adequate health and nutrition, stimulation within the home, community and school environments, protection from violence and attention to cognitive, linguistic, social, emotional and physical development” (UNESCO 2015, p.12).

The Government of Balochistan (GoB) requires to put together legislation and policy provision to guarantee at least one year of free and compulsory quality pre-primary education for all including the poorest and most disadvantaged children through ECCE services. The provincial government should also prepare integrated ECCE policies and strategies while promoting effective coordination between provincial departments such as Health, Education, Social Welfare, Special Education, Non-formal, Literacy and Human Rights and Law and Parliamentary Affairs as well as between other relevant departments. The provincial government also needs to consider devising clear policies, strategies and plans for the professionalization of ECCE personnel. Finally, SDG 4, target 4.2 also demands designing and implementing inclusive, accessible and integrated programmes, services and infrastructure for quality ECCE services, particularly for children with disabilities.

### Findings and Analysis

The policy focus on Early Childhood Education (ECE) dates back to 1992. Since then successive national education policies have highlighted ECE as a priority area. More recently, the Education for All (EFA) initiatives provided impetus to ECE and National Education Policy 2009 as well as on-going consultations for the preparation of National Education Policy 2016 clearly underlining ECE as a priority area. The ECE Plan 2011-2015, National Education Policy 2009, the Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-2018 and the Draft Provincial School Education Policy of Balochistan all emphasise ECE in line with the EFA initiative. The scope of ECE further strengthened under SDG 4, target 4.2 where the focus is now shifted towards early childhood care and education (ECCE).

Following is the legislation and the policy provisions related to pre-primary education, early childhood development and care as delineated in the SDG 4, target 4.2:

Relevant Legislation	Relevant Policies/Plans
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Balochistan Child Protection Act, 2016</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Early Childhood Education Policy Framework 2015</li> <li>Early Childhood Education (ECE) Plan 2011-2015</li> <li>National Education Policy 2009</li> <li>Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-2018</li> <li>Draft Provincial School Education Policy of Balochistan</li> </ul>

There is no legislation in Balochistan covering provision of free and compulsory pre-primary education, ECCE. The Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014 only covers children between 5 and 16 years in primary, middle and secondary schools. However, several policies have been formulated to offer direction on pre-primary education/early childhood education and development. In addition, the Balochistan Child Protection Act, 2016 promulgates care and protection elements.

In Balochistan province, pre-primary mainly consists of the 'kachi' class of un-admitted children and in some cases 'reformed kachi' classes use the national curriculum of ECE. The BESP approach to ECE puts forward three key points to promote ECE in the province i.e. increasing acceptance of ECE in the sector, institutionalisation and expansion linking ECE to health, nutrition and wellbeing. The BESP also proposes the development of a policy framework on ECE.

The Early Childhood Education Policy Framework 2015 developed by the Policy Planning & Implementation Unit (PPIU) within the Secondary Education Department, GoB, is more aligned with the SDG 4 target. The framework suggests that children from four to eight years should be focused for on ECE in two definitive categories i.e. four to five and five to eight years extending ECE from class katchi to class 2. The framework recommends a holistic child development strategy with adequate resource allocation for ECE classroom infrastructure, ECE environment with a focus on health, hygiene and nutrition, teacher training and community and caregiver involvement in child development. However, despite efforts, implementing these policies have been a greater challenge in the local context in Baluchistan as one key informant argued:

“As more than half of our schools are single-teacher and multi-grades schools and not all of our teachers are trained in multi-grade teaching as well as in early childhood development and as you know ECE require play and story-telling methods. Since our teachers are not trained in ECE, and they don't understand the needs of children, it is difficult for them to deliver quality ECE education.”

The Balochistan Child Protection Act, 2016 aligns early childhood development and care in terms of protecting from:

[(a) physical violence or injury; (b) mental violence; (c) neglect or negligent treatment; (d) maltreatment; (e) exploitation; and (f) sexual abuse or sexual exploitation].

The Act further stipulates that the child's best interest must be protected;

[The child's level of education and educational requirements]

[All state bodies, agencies and organisations, public and private social welfare

institutions and civil society organisations shall safeguard and promote the best interests of the child in need of protection.]

[For the full and harmonious development of a child's personality, a child should preferably grow up in a family social structure and environment. Where special protection of a child or assistance to the parent(s) or carers is required from the state, including out-of-home care...]

## Conclusions and Recommendations

It is evident from the discussions/interviews with primary sources and reviewing available literature, legislation and policy documents that the absence of appropriate legislation on ECCE/ECE is causing incoherence in policy provisions. One example is the discrepancy of age for ECE which appears to be one year in policy documents such as the BESP i.e. katchi or reformed katchi before class 1; however, the Early Childhood Education Policy Framework 2015 suggests that ECE should target all 4 to 8 year old children (from class katchi to class 2) in the province.

In fact, ECCE is not part of any of the existing policy provisions. Instead, the focus is on ECE and pre-primary education as katchi class of un-admitted children with no prescribed curriculum and outside the remit of modern CEC concepts. In addition, there is no legal and policy provision for at least 1 year free and compulsory pre-primary education based on ECCE services.

The Early Childhood Education Policy Framework 2015 touches upon ECCE services in terms of positive development in early childhood, child growth and development. The framework claims to be based on universally accepted principals for designing and implementing quality ECD/ECE services and programmes; emphasising on developing linkages across the system connecting people, resources and organisations (PPIU 2015). The framework offers a promising start towards achieving SDG 4, target 4.1, however, the orientation of the Early Childhood Education Policy Framework 2015 is anchored on EFA initiative advocating ECE and is missing the care and development element which characterises the ECCE. During the discussion and interviews, it was noticed that stakeholders, particularly from government, are keen to incorporate ECCE provisions in their policies and practices as a key informant elaborated:

“The implementation strategies addressing upgradation of existing facilities prioritize inclusion of a second room in schools where there is only one room as well as ECCE facilities in the primary sections of all government school in the province”.

There is a need to shift the policy focus from ECE to ECCE in the province by harmonising the various policy documents i.e. the BESP and The Early Childhood Education Policy Framework 2015. Following are the recommendations to bring into line the legislation and policies with the SDG 4, target 4.2 i.e. ensuring access of all children (boys and girls) including children with disadvantaged background and with disabilities, towards at least one year pre-primary education adhering to the quality early childhood development and care i.e. ECCE services:

- the legislators should consider introducing new legislation or amending existing, such as the Balochistan Compulsory Education Bill, 2014 to create provision for SDG 4, target 4.2 for at least one year compulsory pre-primary education in the province on the premise of ECCE i.e. addressing the care, child development and wellbeing elements.

- there is a need to revise available policy documents to shift the policy focus from ECE to ECCE encapsulating policies that are integrated, inclusive, accessible for disadvantaged children and those with disabilities, to promote effective coordination between provincial departments and professionalization of ECCE personnel.
- both legislation and policy focus should be made consistent in terms of children's age for pre-primary education.
- guidance should be taken from the Draft Provincial School Education Policy of Balochistan that aims to “prepare strong foundations for children through effective early childhood care and development”.
- comprehensive legislation is required to holistically look at the varying age groups at pre primary and primary level.

### 2.3 Equal Access to Affordable, Quality Technical, Vocational and Tertiary Education

By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university (Target 4.3)

To achieve SDG 4, target 4.3, the Government of Balochistan is to develop comprehensive cross-sector policies for skill development, TVET and higher education in partnership with public and private sectors. The TVET should link market needs in local, provincial, national and international businesses while policies should offer distance tertiary/higher education. The inclusive and equal access to affordable TEVT and higher education is a pre-requisite of achieving SDG 4, target 4.3.

#### Findings and Analysis

There is recognition among key stakeholders that TVET is not adequately covered in the BESP as one key informant underlined:

“I think our education sector plan missed out on TVET aspects. As TVET provisions helps children who are not academically sound and can pursue alternative roots through vocational and technical training”.

Another participant during discussions accepted:

“We know that TVET is a missing link in our education sector plan and since it is a prominent feature of SDG 4, we are working towards incorporating TVET in our policies and plans”.

The National Education Policy 2009 recognises that despite having legislative provisions in place for some time such as the Pakistan's Apprenticeship Ordinance, 1962, the Apprenticeship Rules 1966 and the Pakistan National Training Ordinance, 1980, the technical and vocational education system is not geared up to fulfil the requirements of the labour market. Below are the national and provincial legislative and policy provisions focused on access to TEVT and higher education:



Relevant Legislation	Relevant Policies/Plans
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Authority Act, 2011</li> <li>• The National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act, 2011</li> <li>• The Higher Education Commission Ordinance, 2002</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Vision 2025: One Nation – One Vision</li> <li>• National Education Policy 2009</li> <li>• Skills for Growth &amp; Development, A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015</li> <li>• The National Skills Strategy 2009-2013</li> <li>• TVET Reform Support Programme 2011-2016</li> <li>• Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-2018</li> </ul>

The National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act, 2011 was enacted to facilitate, regulate and provide policy direction for technical education and vocational training and the establishment of a National Vocational and Technical Education Commission (NAVTEC) in Pakistan. This followed the formulation of The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Act, 2011 to facilitate vocational, technical, skills training as well as to establish the Women's Training and Employment Cell in the province. B-TVETA in close coordination with the provincial departments of Labour & Manpower, Education, Industries & Commerce, Social Welfare and Women Development. However, B-TVETA has not been an effective legislation. During interviews and discussions one participant uncovered some of the facts pertaining to B-TVETA:

“We know that B-TVETA act passed in 2011; however it was dormant for some time. B-TVETA should have had some technical institutions. However, B-TVETA was not able to deliver on its promises”.

In 2011, the National Skills Strategy 2009-2013 was formulated to provide policy direction, support and an enabling environment to the public and private sectors to implementing training for skills development to enhance social and economics profile (NAVTEC 2010). To implement the National Skills Strategy 2009-2013, the TVET Reform Support Programme (TRSP) was initiated in 2011 focussing on governance, developing a National Vocational Qualification Framework (NVQF), innovative training delivery, capacity building of provincial TEVTAs and imparting cooperative vocational training and green skills (TRSP 2016).

Based on the work and experience under TRSP, a new national TVET policy was devised in 2015. The national TVET policy is fully committed to the long-term Vision 2025, recognising that priority must be given to human capital development. Skills development is crucial to the achievement of the national goals set out in Vision 2025.

In terms of tertiary/higher education, Vision 2025 strongly promotes the knowledge revolution and knowledge economy agenda. Higher education in Balochistan is governed by the Higher Education Commission Ordinance, 2002. However, colleges in the province are managed and regulated by the Higher Education Department within the Education Department and Board of intermediate Secondary Education in line with BESP policy guidance.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 as well as Vision 2025 are two policy documents that strongly advance the TVET agenda outlined in the SDG 4, target 4.3. There are opportunities for Balochistan to take advantage of renewed support for TVET in Vision 2025 and other national policy documents to streamline provincial legislation and policies. The discussions during interviews and discussions highlighted the following gaps:

- The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Authority Act, 2011 paved the way to establish B-TEVTA to regulate and promote vocational training and technical education in the province. This Act, however, is unclear on equal access to women and men.
- The higher/tertiary education, in particular university education is not covered by any provincial legislation or policy directives i.e. BESP.
- The provincial law and policies i.e. BESP, do not clearly promote strong inter-departmental coordination mechanisms within the province or at federal level as well as with private sector organisations.
- The fee and affordability is not part of any legislation or policy documents which is an important element of SDG 4, target 4.3.

In order to remove these gaps, below are some recommendations:

- The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Authority Act, 2011 should be amended and inclusive and gender equality should be addressed to guide the policies.
- Appropriate law or policies should be devised to bring university education into the provincial ambit. In addition, clear institutional arrangements for college and university education should be outlined.
- The policy provision should encourage strong inter-departmental coordination mechanisms at provincial and federal level as well as with the private sector.
- Policies should be able to give clarity on fee and affordability factors.

## 2.4 Skills for Decent Work and Entrepreneurship for Youths and Adults

By 2030, ensure that all youths and adults have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent work and entrepreneurship (Target 4.4)

The SDG 4, target 4.4 reiterates the importance of TVET and highlights the need to formulate flexible, evidence-based, demand-based, work and classroom-based accredited and recognised quality skill training and TVET programmes with transferable skills. These education and training programmes may also introduce entrepreneurial, basic and ICT skills and support through career and counselling services. The stakeholders of the legislative review and policy gap analysis stressed the need for aligning SDG 4.4 with the economic policies and employment plans so that the unskilled/unemployed youth may be better planned to serve the direction set under this target.

### Findings and Analysis

The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Authority Act, 2011 is aimed to harmonise technical and vocational training with changing circumstances, but it simply provides the basis for the establishment of an authority (B-TEVTA) to regulate and promote vocational training and technical education in Balochistan. Thus, there is no provincial legislation equipped to cater for a comprehensive TVET framework as outlined in the SDG 4, target 4.4.

However, national policy documents such as Vision 2025 and TVET Policy (i.e. Skills for Growth & Development, A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015) appear to be closely aligned with the SDG 4, target 4.4. In particular, the TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 with its eight objectives offers a comprehensive TVET framework. It emphasise on securing a national commitment to impart skill development trainings for at least one million young and adults. The objective is to train 20 percent of all school leavers by 2025 through public and private sector institutions. The policy also stresses on introducing national standards-based assessment and certification system in line with international recognised qualifications.<sup>3</sup> It is important to note that there is no provincial equivalent of Skills for Growth & Development, A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 that could offer a TVET framework in Balochistan.

Relevant Legislation	Relevant Policies/Plans
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Authority Act, 2011</li> <li>• The National Vocational and Technical Training Commission Act, 2011</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Vision 2025: One Nation – One Vision</li> <li>• Balochistan Youth Policy 2015</li> <li>• Skills for Growth &amp; Development, A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015</li> <li>• The National Skills Strategy 2009-2013</li> <li>• Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-2018</li> </ul>

The Balochistan Youth Policy 2015 is also a useful document promoting economically active youths having opportunities for rightful and gainful employment, livelihood, training, financial credit and other services in the province. The Balochistan Youth Policy 2015 puts emphasis on provision for skill development and vocational training in line with regional clustering and economic corridors. The policy also encourages public and private universities to carry out exploratory studies, skill mapping and market analysis in Balochistan.

### Conclusions and Recommendations

There is no provincial legislative or policy provision covering the aspects as underlined in the SDG 4, target 4.4. It is therefore, important to devise legislation and policies along with lines of Skills for Growth & Development, A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015, Vision 2025 and the Balochistan Youth Policy 2015. The national TVET Policy 2015 and The Balochistan Youth Policy 2015 offer a framework and a good starting point to align provincial legislation and policy provisions to SDG 4, target 4.4 to ensure that all youth and adults have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent work and entrepreneurship.

Following are the recommendations to address the absence of provincial legislation and policy provision pertaining to SDG 4, target 4.4:

- The legislators in the province may consider strengthening existing provincial legislation to provide policy guidance linking policies with SDG 4, target 4.4. This is also very important in the current context where the China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) is unfolding and may provide an opportunity for establishment and regeneration of an economic zone which could create job opportunities for youths and adults in the province.
- The long-awaited B-TEVTA policy should be approved and finalised. The policy focus should be on

3. Skills for Growth & Development: A Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Policy for Pakistan, Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, Government of Pakistan.

developing coordination and partnership between the public and private sector. In addition, priority should be given to the TVET curriculum, the assessment system under BICE as well as improving human resources and expanding technical institutions and provision of TVET.

- The comprehensive TVET framework as outlined in the SDG 4, target 4.4 should be used as guiding principle for all future legislation and policy formulation. It is important to take full benefit from the existing policies such as The Skills for Growth & Development: A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 and Vision 2025.

## 2.5 Elimination of Gender Disparities and Discrimination

By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations (Target 4.5)

SDG 4, target 4.5 promotes quality education and vocational training for girls and women. Target 4.5 also entails that education policies, sector plans and budget are based on equality and non-discrimination considering effective risk assessment for emergencies such as disaster and conflicts and that they cater for the needs of the vulnerable i.e. IDPs and refugees. Target 4.5 also ensures support for a comprehensive approach to make schools resilient to disaster and focus on school disaster management, risk reduction and resilience. The promotion of distance learning and use of ICT to facilitate learning in conflict zone and remote areas is also within the remit of SDG 4, target 4.5. Furthermore the provision of education to malnourished children in most poverty stricken areas is also linked to this target to address vulnerabilities associated to food and poverty. It is also directly linked with the cognitive abilities of children impacting their learning abilities. To address this target, there needs to develop an umbrella policy framework to assure inter sectoral collaboration particularly related to health, education, special education, social welfare, women's development, food and agriculture and poverty reduction plans or policies.

It is important to point out that during discussions/interviews, the Balochistan Gender Policy and Implementation Plan was mentioned by the participants, however, despite concerted efforts it was not possible to get hold of these documents.

One of the GoP's social safety programme of i.e. National Cash Transfer Programme – BISP largely contributed to address vulnerabilities of children belonging to ultra poor families as per poverty assessment survey conducted by the World Bank. A high proportion of 74% of the children from ultra poor families are reported to be out of school across Pakistan. Aurat Foundation in collaboration with BISP mapped out those families in six districts of Balochistan and identified out of school children between the ages of 5 and 12 years. After massive campaign and social mobilization, AF assisted BISP, Balochistan in getting 28,259 children's back to primary schools in these six districts. The programme is still on-going in remaining districts and being implemented in phase in the province.

## Findings and Analysis

Pakistan Vision 2025 promises a just and equitable society where vulnerable and marginalized segments of the society would be mainstreamed. The Vision 2025 seeks to create an inclusive education system for special children, minorities and people with disabilities.

The Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014 clearly advocates free and compulsory education for children, especially girls, between the ages of 5 and 16. The Act also emphasise on extending the free and compulsory education to children with mental or physical disabilities with provision for special education in the vicinity. The Act does not clearly mention of vulnerable children or children in disaster or conflict situation, i.e. IDPs and refugees.

Relevant Legislation	Relevant Policies/Plans
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Balochistan Compulsory Education Act, 2014</li> <li>• The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Authority Act, 2011</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-2018</li> <li>• Vision 2025: One Nation – One Vision</li> <li>• Skills for Growth &amp; Development, A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015</li> <li>• The National Skills Strategy 2009-2013</li> </ul>

The Balochistan Education Sector Plan 2013-18 (BESP) is committed to remove gender gaps and mainstream marginalised groups including females into the regular education system. As one participant said:

“All over schools are designated as gender-free school lately. The policy is to promote gender balance and encouraging both boys and girls to attend schools”.

However, the initiatives towards gender-free schools only effective in primary education and the drop rate increases, particularly for girls in secondary education. This challenge has been explained by one of the key informant during interviews and discussions:

“The gender-free school is mostly effective in primary schools. As our culture does not allow girls aged 12 and over to attend mixed schools, and keeping in view that majority of our rural schools are multi-grade with only one teacher in most of the cases, it pose challenges to ensure girls participation in secondary education”.

The BESP proposes the community schools model in villages without school facilities, the up-gradation policy and mainstreaming dropped out children through non-formal education. The BESP also addresses attitudinal barriers to female education through awareness campaign and incentivising the girls' enrolment. The BESP remains aligned with the idea of inclusive education and focus on disabled and Afghan refugee children in the province and fully committed to ensuring that all children “regardless of gender, abilities, disabilities and socio-economic, cultural, and ethnic backgrounds”:

- are treated with dignity and respect;
- have equal access to education, health services, work and all other aspects of life;
- are enabled to develop their full academic, physical, emotional and social potential;
- have access to learning material in appropriate media and technical devices;
- develop confidence in their abilities, skills and future prospects

The BESP sought guidance from the National Education Policy 2009 to streamline and institutionalise its policy direction toward including Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR) and conflict situations. The BESP strategic objectives promote the development and institutionalisation a separate policy on DRR including conflict situations for the education sector in Balochistan. As part of these efforts, the BESP seeks to prepare DRR plans for risk prevention, mitigation and preparedness as well as plans for enhancement of DRR responsiveness. As one key informant provided insight and the current efforts that are underway at present:

“We formed a provincial working group on DRR comprised of area experts belong to different stakeholder and partner organization. In addition, we are also looking at intervention from civil society organizations/ NGOs in various districts, their focus, learning materials and training manual that they are using and trying to work with them. We would like to provide training to our DRR working group members, our education managers at district level after assessing their needs and requirements as well as keeping in view our culture and local context”

The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Authority Act, 2011 does not specifically address gender equality or issues around inclusivity of marginalised groups such as disabled people or IDPs etc. However, national policies such as the National Skill Strategy 2009-2013 and the TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 both focus on improving access, equity and employability of women, disadvantaged groups and vocational training ensuring gender balanced provisions.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

The existing national and provincial legislation and policies on primary and secondary education unequivocally support the elimination of gender disparities to ensure equal access for girls and women and hence strongly advocate inclusive education. The provincial Education Sector Plan (ESP) also aims to respond to vulnerable conflict situations and advocates putting DRR policies in place in terms of mitigation, preparedness and responsiveness and incorporated into District Education Plans developed for 31 districts in the province. However, provincial legislation and policies do not effectively address the needs pertaining to vocational training opportunities for the vulnerable i.e. people with disabilities, indigenous people/children in vulnerable situations, IDPs and refugees.

There are no legislative and policy direction to promote distance learning and use of ICT to facilitate learning in conflict zone and remote areas. These issues are extremely important in Balochistan context where remote and scattered settlements pose challenge to provide learning opportunities. Thus, use of ICT should be taken on board in legislative provision that can then inform policies for effectively achieving SDG 4, target 4.5.

In this regards, current national policies such as Pakistan Vision 2025, Skills for Growth & Development, A TVET Policy for Pakistan 2015 and The National Skills Strategy 2009-2013 do address these issues to a greater extent. Thus, these national policy provisions should be used to inform the provincial legislative and policies in line with SDG 4, target 4.5.

## 2.6 Literacy and Numeracy for Youths and Adults

By 2030, ensure that all youth and adults, both men and women, reach a proficiency level in literacy and numeracy sufficient to fully participate in society (Target 4.6)

The benefits of having youths and adults equipped with functional literacy and numeracy skills are well recognised, however, achieving it proved to be a greater challenge. It is important to devise policies and plans for the provision of quality literacy and numeracy programmes that are contextualised according to local social setup, culture, tradition, economic activities linked with skill development activities. The development of assessment framework based on learning outcomes is the key to quality learning. Particular attention should be given to girls, women and other vulnerable groups. It is also important to develop effective coordination and

partnerships between public, private and civil society organisations to scale up the efforts to promote adult literacy, numeracy and skill development using ICT and mobile technologies available in the area.

## Findings and Analysis

The Education for All (EFA) Plan for Balochistan 2011-15 reiterates one of the international agreed goals put forward under The Dakar Framework for Action: Education for All in 2000 advocating access by youths and adults to adult literacy, education and skill programmes especially by women. The Plan underscores making effective and coordinated efforts to promote education, literacy and lifelong learning for children, youths and adults and connects literacy as a measure towards poverty reduction and human development. The Plan recognises the shortcomings of quality and relevance as well as accreditation, equivalence and certification while imparting adult literacy and non-formal learning for youths and adults in the province.

Relevant Legislation	Relevant Policies/Plans
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-2018</li> <li>• Education for All Plan: Balochistan 2011-15</li> <li>• National Education Policy 2009</li> <li>• The National Curriculum for Literacy: Basic Literacy and Numeracy, Functional Literacy and Income Generating Skills 2007</li> <li>• The National Skills Strategy 2009-2013</li> </ul>

The National Curriculum for Literacy: Functional Literacy and Income Generating Skills 2007 outlines the following three levels of literacy:

- Level One: Basic literacy and numeracy for reading and writing simple sentences and performing two-digit numeric operations (equal to Class 1).
- Level Two: Reading newspaper/magazine and writing expressions in Urdu and able to solve five-digit addition and three-digit subtraction.
- Level Three: Understand and able to read and write with speed, accuracy and fluency. English is also introduced (equal to Class 4)

The National Education Policy 2009 proposes some useful policy proposals such as strengthening organisational structure, coordination and budgetary allocation, developing the curriculum, quality standards, assessment framework and accreditation and equivalence systems to ensure quality. In addition, some useful suggestions include linking adult and non-formal education with industry, internship and vocational and skill development programmes. The National Skills Strategy 2009-2013 also reiterates that basic literacy and numeracy would be an essential part of the initiative to address skills development needs of youth and adult workers in the informal sector.

There is recognition in the BESP in terms of adult literacy that has been given low priority in the provincial education policies and plans in the past. The BESP now envisages promoting adult literacy to focus on its large youth population with the strategic objective of institutionalisation of Youth/Adult Literacy (YAL) and Non-

Formal Basic Education (NFBE) programmes within the mainstream education system in the province. The BESP suggests developing a policy framework for adult literacy in the province. The BESP clearly offers limited details on adult literacy that are inadequate to meet the commitment required to achieve the SGD 4, target 4.6.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

There are no provincial legislation in Balochistan covering the provision of literacy and numeracy skills for youths and adults. In addition, being the most influential policy document, the Balochistan Education Sector Plan 2013-18 addresses literacy and numeracy for youth inadequately and only begins to realise devising a policy framework in this area.

The Education for All Plan: Balochistan 2011-15 advocates effective coordination among departments for imparting functional literacy for youths and adults and connecting these programmes to formal education or skill development initiatives. This Plan also focuses on assessment, quality, relevance, recognition, accreditation and certification of literacy and numeracy programmes.

There is an urgent need to integrate adult/functional literacy and numeracy skills into existing or new legislative and policy provisions. The national policy documents, such as The National Education Policy 2009 and The National Curriculum for Literacy: Functional Literacy and Income Generating Skills 2007 can be used as guiding documents to inform the provincial legislation and policies.

It is also recommended that legislators may consider, while devising these legislation and policies, to contextualise according to local social setup, culture, gender disparities, tradition, and economic activities linked with skill development activities. In addition, a comprehensive assessment framework based on learning outcomes is critical to ensure quality learning. The use of ICT and mobile technology should also be considered as a means of delivering these initiatives.

## 2.7 Knowledge and Skills for Sustainable Development

By 2030, ensure all learners acquire knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including among others through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship, and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development (Target 4.7)

Target 4.7 of SDG 4 requires aligning provincial policies and programmes with the values of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) and Global Citizenship Education (GCED) in formal, non-formal and informal education. UNESCO articulates both of these concepts as:

“ESD empowers learners to take informed decisions and responsible actions for environmental integrity, economic viability and a just society, for present and future generations, while respecting cultural diversity. It is about lifelong learning, and is an integral part of quality education”.

“GCED aims to empower learners to assume active roles to face and resolve global challenges and to become proactive contributors to a more peaceful, tolerant, inclusive and secure world”.



The target also aspires to provide learners (both genders) with knowledge, skills and value-based ESD and GCED as lifelong learning, share good practices among regions and countries using an interdisciplinary multi-stakeholder approach with robust assessment systems. For this purpose a long term and sustainable approach might work in shape of appointing an SDG desk at P&D department in Balochistan which is held responsible to assess the learning outcomes and periodically measure learning impact of the learners.

## Findings and Analysis

The ideas around ESD and GCED are yet to be introduced in the province. These action programmes offer an opportunity for the province to actively participate in a globalised world. However, existing provincial legislative and policy provisions do not cover the themes of these global action programmes such as human rights, peace and responsible citizenship from local to global levels, gender equality, sustainable development and health.

The National Education Policy 2009, however, under its curriculum reform agenda, underlines policy actions relevant to SDG 4, target 4.7. The policy recommends reforming the curriculum by introducing fundamental rights, environmental education, school health, life skills based education, education against HIV/AIDS and other infectious diseases, school safety, disaster and risk management, peace education and inter-faith harmony. The policy also suggests introducing entrepreneurial studies shall be introduced to develop entrepreneurial and business skills in students of general education to make them productive and self oriented citizens.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

There is no legislative or policy provision covering ESD and GCED themes. The National Education Policy 2009 offers a very useful way to guide and inform the provincial legislation and policies to incorporate themes identified in the ESD and GCED global action programmes.

It is recommended that legislators may consider reviewing the provincial legislation and policies to bring it in line with SDG 4, target 4.7, in terms of introducing global citizenship, human rights, peace and harmonisation, appreciating culture and cultural diversity and its contribution to sustainable development. Forming an SDG desk housed at P&D might serve the purpose of sustainable monitoring and assessment of learning outcomes and impact of the learners towards a peaceful society.

## 2.8 Building and Upgrading Education Facilities

**By 2030, build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all (Target 4a)**

The first means of implementation i.e. SGD 4, target 4a advocates devising policies for schools to be safe and free from violence as well as sensitive to gender and disabilities. Target 4a also requires policies to ensure availability of water, electricity, safe, functional and adequate gender-segregated toilets as well as appropriate learning materials and technology. The schools are considered as safe spaces and can be used for non-formal, adult learning and community learning centres with equitable resource allocation.

## Findings and Analysis

The BESP emphasises creating a learner and teacher friendly school environment and recognises that learner-unfriendly school construction, missing facilities with high incidence of corporal punishment are some of the challenges faced by the province; it aspires to “develop a child and learning-friendly school environment, as per local socio-cultural norms, both physically and socially to make learning an interesting and comfortable experience” (BESP 2013, p.45). The BESP also promotes adopting strategies to incorporate elements of child-friendly school design in future constructions. The Plan stipulates overcoming missing facilities such as water, electricity, toilets and boundary walls in schools and recommends construction of two toilets in middle and secondary schools.

The BESP, although recognising security challenges in some part of the province, does not provide any plan or strategies to deal with the security challenges while ensuring that schools are safer spaces for teaching and learning.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

The BESP provides policy directions on creating a learner and teacher-friendly school environment and provision of basic facilities such as water, electricity, toilets and boundary walls. However, on security issues, the BESP fails to put forward credible strategies or plans, especially considering the current security situation in the province.

There are no assurances on equitable resource allocations or on using schools as learning spaces for non-formal, adult and community learning centres. In addition, there are no specific proposals for catering for children with disabilities in terms of incorporating their needs and requirements in to building design.

There is a need to address the issues of safety, security and violence-free schools in the legislation and policies. The policies should address the needs and requirements of children with disabilities in the building design.

## 2.9 International Scholarships in Tertiary Education

By 2030, substantially increase support for scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training and information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes, in developed countries and other developing countries (Target 4b)

The second means of implementation, target 4b, requires developing programmes and policies for promoting international scholarships particularly for youths, women and men from disadvantaged background

## Findings and Analysis

The BESP outlines various institutional arrangements where higher education institutions operate in the province. The federal Higher Education Commission (HEC) formulates policies and regulates the sector in Balochistan. There is a Higher Education Department within the provincial Education Department that manages colleges. The universities in the province are autonomous bodies chartered by the provincial assembly.

The Higher Education Commission (HEC) manages several scholarship schemes in Pakistan. The provincial quota for the foreign scholarships is 200 while 400 indigenous scholarships are also offered to Balochistan domiciled applicants.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

The province of Balochistan does not have any legislation of policies focusing on higher education. The higher education system in the province is governed and regulated by the federal Higher Education Commission (HEC).

It is recommended that provincial Education Department should liaise and work closely with the HEC in terms of building regional and international linkages for higher education and research scholarship opportunities for students in Balochistan.

### 2.10 Training of Teachers

By 2030, all learners are taught by qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing States (Target 4c)

The third and last means of implementation, target 4c, requires legislation to enhance the profile of the teaching profession by improving market competitiveness and to devise strategies to attract the best and most motivated candidates for teaching; also to formulate policies for qualification frameworks, quality, equitable, gender-sensitive management, recruitment & selection, remuneration, use of ICT and technology, continuous professional development and working conditions.

## Findings and Analysis

The BESP outlines two provisions pertaining to teacher training i.e. in-service and pre-service training. The BESP advocates moving towards a Continuous Professional Development (CPD) approach with built-in feedback mechanisms and benchmarks for evaluation. The Sector Plan advocates developing effective coordination between the Provincial Institute for Teacher Education (PITE) and provincial Directorate of Schools to ensure transparent selection of teachers, realistic need assessment and feedback on impact in the classroom as well as enhancing the capacity to develop, implement and review quality in-service teacher training.

The BESP recommends enhancing capacity to develop, manage and implement pre-service training to produce quality teachers with a well rounded comprehension of the various aspects of education including assessments, curriculum, textbooks, planning, ECE etc. It was highlighted during discussions and interviews that a CPD strategic plan is underway in the province which will focus on pre-service and in-service training.

“We would like to work on continuous professional development of our staff and working on a strategic plan which enables training of trainers as well as staff training and development in a range of areas. We expect our teachers to gain knowledge, skills and techniques and use them in the classroom with children”.

## Conclusions and Recommendations

The current BESP policy directions for teachers training require thorough review to align the policy with SDG 4, target 4c (means of implementation). There is a need to incorporate gender-sensitive strategies through legislation to improve working conditions and competitive remuneration to attract the best teachers. There is a need to review the existing policy provision for teacher training provisions and link it with the qualification framework and continuous professional development. The policy should also include use of ICT and mobile technology to help with challenges faced by students with disabilities or learning difficulties by using media/visual literacy options.

## Bibliography

- i. ASER (2015) Annual Status of Education Report 2015, Pakistan, National – Rural.
- ii. ASER (2015a) Annual Status of Education Report 2015, Balochistan Rural.
- iii. GoP (2014) Pakistan 2025 – One Nation – One Vision, Planning Commission, Ministry of Planning, Development & Reform, Government of Pakistan (GoP), National Economic Council, May 2014.
- iv. GoP (2015) Skills for Growth & Development: A Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Policy for Pakistan, Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, Government of Pakistan.
- v. ITA (2016) Critical Reference and Action Documents on the Sustainable Development Goal 4 2016-2030: Goals-Targets-Indicators & Framework for Action – SDG 4, Idara-Taleem-o-Aagahi (ITA)/ Pakistan Coalition for Education (PCE)/ South Asian Forum for Education Development (SAFED)
- vi. LEAD (2015) Translating Sustainable Development Goals at the Country Level, The Global Goals for Sustainable Development, Produced by Knowledge Hub on SDGs, LEAD Pakistan/The Asia Foundation.
- vii. PCE (2015) Legislation on Right to Education in Pakistan: A Critical Review, Pakistan Coalition for Education (PCE), Society for Access to Quality Education / Ilm Ideas – Advocacy and Innovation Funds for education in Pakistan, April 2015.
- viii. PPIU (2013) Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-2018, Policy Planning and Implementation Unit (PPIU), Education Department, Government of Balochistan.
- ix. PPIU (2015) Early Childhood Education Policy Framework 2015, Policy Planning and Implementation Unit (PPIU), Education Department, Government of Balochistan. March 2015.
- x. Siddiq A (2016) Pakistan: The Road Towards Achieving the SDGs, Issue Brief, Institute of Strategic Studies, April 2016.
- xi. TRSP (2016) News Feed, TVET Reform Support Programme: Technical and Vocational Education and Training.
- xii. UN (2015) Resolution Adopted by the General Assembly on 25th September 2015, Transforming Our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.
- xiii. [http://www.un.org/ga/search/view\\_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E](http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E)
- xiv. UNDG (2016) Pakistan: Making Progress on the SDGs through Commitment and Institutional Readiness, United Nations Development Group, [https://undg.org/main/undg\\_document/pakistan-making-progress-on-the-sdgs-through-commitment-and-institutional-readiness-at-multiple-levels-of-government/](https://undg.org/main/undg_document/pakistan-making-progress-on-the-sdgs-through-commitment-and-institutional-readiness-at-multiple-levels-of-government/)
- xv. UNESCO (2015) Education 2030: Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action, UNESCO/ UNICEF/the World Bank/UNFPA/UNDP/UN Women/UNHCR, World Education Forum 2015, Incheon, Republic of Korea, 19-22 May 2015.
- xvi. UNESCO (2016) Unpacking Sustainable Development Goal 4 – Education 2030 - Guide, 2nd Edition, September 2016, UNESCO/PCR.

## Annex 1 List of Key Legislation and Policy Documents Reviewed

1. Draft Provincial School Education Policy of Balochistan
2. The Balochistan Private Educational Institutions Registration, Regulation and Promotion Act 2016
3. The Balochistan Child Protection Act 2016
4. Balochistan Youth Policy 2015
5. The Balochistan Compulsory Education Act 2014
6. The Balochistan Introduction of Mother Languages as Compulsory Additional Subject at Primary Level Act 2014
7. The Balochistan Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Bill no. 2 of 2011
8. Balochistan Education Sector Plan 2013 – 2018
9. Draft Provincial School education Policy of Balochistan
10. Early Childhood Education Policy Framework 2015
11. Draft Policy for Education Management Information System (EMIS) for Balochistan Province
12. Standard Operating Procedures for Curriculum and Textbook Development 2014
13. District Education Sector Plans

## Annex 2 Interview Guidelines For Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) and Key Informant Interviews (KIIs)

### Primary and Secondary Education (including Early Childhood and Pre-primary Education)

1. Do we have the legislation and policies in place to guarantee free, publically funded, inclusive, equitable primary and secondary education in Balochistan? How many years?
2. Is there any provision/element in these legislation/policies for compulsory primary and secondary education for all children in Balochistan? How many years?
3. What are the legislation, policies provision for standards and review curricula promoting quality of education in terms of relevance to the local context in Balochistan?
4. Do you think these legislation and policies strengthen schools/institutions in terms of efficiency, effectiveness, leadership and governance while involving communities, young people and parents in managing these schools/institutions?
5. What are the legislation, policies ensuring early learning in first/home language or mother tongue?
6. Are there any policy provision promoting alternative modes of learning for out of school children and youth at primary and secondary level? i.e. flexible learning, accredited programmes?
7. What are the policy legislation/ provisions for early childhood care and education in terms of free and compulsory quality pre-primary education in Balochistan (at least one year)? i.e. preparing children for primary education, including the arrangements for ensuring adequate health and nutrition at home, community and school environment in a safe and secure environment?
8. Are there any arrangements for training, capacity building and professional development opportunities for early childhood care and education teachers/staff/personnel?
9. Are all education focused legislation/policies gender/disability sensitive and ensure safe and violence free school environment?
10. What are the important aspects of legislation, policies/ plans (if any) to guarantee equitable and equal and non-discriminatory access to education in Balochistan? i.e. gender, vulnerable and excluded groups, disaster, conflicts (IDPs / Afghan refugees)

### Technical & Vocational Education & Training / Higher/tertiary education

11. Please highlight the legislation/policies for technical and vocational education, skill development and tertiary education for young people. Is there any cross-sectoral (public, private sector, employers, industry, union) linkages to promote TVET and tertiary/higher education >
12. What are the opportunities for young people and mature students (men and women) for distance learning using ICT/technology i.e. internet, online courses in line with recognised quality standards in higher/tertiary education?
13. What are the policies provisions for promoting research culture in tertiary /higher education (i.e. universities) particularly for girls and women in Balochistan?

14. Are there any arrangements providing international, cross-border cooperation and student exchange programmes in higher/tertiary education in Balochistan?
15. Are there any policy arrangements for adult learning, TEVT, tertiary/higher education for youth (boys and girls), men and women?
16. What are the legislation, policies and plans fostering equitable lifelong learning opportunities for youth (boys and girls) / men and women in Balochistan?
17. Do you think Balochistan youth, men and women have access to learning skills in line with labour market, industry needs, local context, informal economy and rural development?
18. Are there any policies responding to work-based or class-room based training and learning opportunities for youth, men and women with appropriate quality assurance system/ framework in Balochistan?
19. What are the important aspects of legislation, policies/ plans (if any) to guarantee equitable and equal and non-discriminatory access to education in Balochistan? i.e. gender, vulnerable and excluded groups, disaster, conflicts (IDPs / Afghan refugees)
20. Are there any efforts in terms of introducing multi-sectoral provisions for involving education, health, social welfare, industry, fisheries and agriculture sectors in Balochistan?
21. Does Balochistan have legislation / policies imparting knowledge on global challenges of sustainable development and global citizenship? i.e. peace, human rights, gender equality, health, climate change, sustainable livelihood.
22. Are all education focused legislation/policies gender/disability sensitive and ensure safe and violence free school environment?

#### Continuing Professional Development/Teacher's training

23. Are there any legislative measures/policies promoting best suited candidates for teaching profession in Balochistan?
24. What are the arrangements for teachers' training i.e. pre-service, in-services and continuous professional development (CPD) in Balochistan?
25. Are there any accreditation/qualification frameworks for teachers (pre-primary, primary, secondary, TVET and tertiary education) in Balochistan?



## Annex 3 Participants' Cluster Details

Participants took part in FGD, KIIs and Provincial Consultative Meeting were divided into the following three clusters:

1. Officials from the Directorate of Education, members of the Directorate of Special Education, teacher training schools/colleges, member education committees, representatives of P&D and LG academies, faculty members from select schools, colleges and universities.
2. Legislators, members of standing committee on education, women's development and human rights, members from government programmes on education, teacher development, vocational training and safety nets, members of the Provincial Commission on the Status of Women (PCSW).
3. Civil society organizations working on education, research institutions, women and girl child empowerment, adult learning and skill-based education and media.

## Annex 4 List of FGD Participants

### List of Participants of Focus Group Discussion 28 January, 2017, Quetta

Sr	Name	Organization	Designation
1	Dr. Faisal Kakar	Dean Baluchistan University of Information Technology Engineering & Management Sciences Quetta.	Dean
2	Nasir Iqbal	Assistant Director Social Welfare	Ass. Director
3	Dr. Zahoor Bazai	Director, University of Balochistan	Director
4	Dr. Sajida Naureen	University of Balochistan	As. Prof
5	Sana Durrani	National Commission on the Status of Women	Member
6	Kalsoom Panezai	Sardar Bahadur Khan Women University	M.Phil Scholar
7	M. Ishaq	Govt of Balochistan	Communication officer
8	Dr. Shagufta Iqbal	Govt Girls Degree College QTA	Principal
9	Prof. Dr. A.Tawab	Balochistan Education Foundation	Managing Director
10	Shareen Taj	University of Balochistan	Assistant Professor
11	Tayyiba Naureen	Sardar Bahadur Khan Women University	M.phill Scholar
12	Kaleemullah	Educationist / free launcer	Consultant
13	Shamshad Kakar	Balochistan Environmental & Education Foundation	PM Scholarships
14	Ziviqar	Pakistan Council of Research in Water Resources	Dy. Director
15	Uzma Khan	Sardar Bahadur Khan Women University	DFO
16	Talat Waheed Khan	Corporate Lawyer	ADV Supreme Court

## Annex 5 List of Key Informants

Sr	Name
1	Mr. Aziz Jamali (Additional Secretary Education (GoB), Balochistan)
2	Mr. Irfan Awan (MD, SCSPEB),
3	Mr. Nazar Kakar (Director, BoC)
4	Mr. Habib Ullah Nasar (Director, RC, HEC, Quetta)
5	Mr. Arif Shah (P&D, Balochistan)
6	Mr. Nazar Kakar (Director, PITE)
7	Dr. Siraj Kakar (Chairman, Board of Intermediate & Secondary Education, Balochistan)
8	Ms. Yasmeen Lehri (MPA, Balochistan)
9	Mr. Qaiser Jamali (UNESCO, Balochistan),
10	Ms. Rehana Khilji (UN-Women Balochistan)
11	Mr. Faiz Bareach Zaranj (Provincial Head, ARC)
12	Mr. Barkat Shah (Manager, IDSP)
13	Mr. Nisar Shah (PPIU)
14	Mr. Abdul Khaliq Achakzai (PPIU)
15	Mr. Fareed Kakar (Manager, NCHD)
16	Mr. Sagheer Ahmad (UNICEF, Balochistan)

## Annex 6 List of Participants - Provincial Consultative Meeting

### Provincial Consultation Meeting, Quetta 10th January 2017

Sr	Name	Contact #	Designation
1	Dr. Zahoor Bazai	Consultant	Consultant AF
2	Mr. A.Malik	Deputy Director	PITE
3	Dr. Gulab	Assistant Director	BOC & CE
4	Mr. Abdul Khaliq	DFP	PPIU
5	Mr. Abdul Haleem Nasar	SSO	IDO
6	Dr. Sajida Naureen	Assistant Prof	UOB
7	Mr. Shoaib Ali	C&R Officer	SCSPEB
8	Mr. Aurangzaib Alizai	Chairperson	Gender Studies, UOB
9	Mr. Atta Muhammad	Divisional Director	BISP, Quetta
10	Dr. M Din		UOB
11	Mr. Fatehullah		BRSP
12	Mr. Kaleemullah	OMB	EOCB
13	Mr. Syed Nisar	DFP	PPIH
14	Ms. Raheela Mir	DOE(F)	DO Education
15	Mr. Faiz Barech	Provincial Head	ARC International
16	Ms. Ambreen Gul	A.Director	WDD
17	Mr.M.Dawood	Provincial liaison officer	UNDP
18	Mr. Sagheer Ahmed	Education Officer	UNICEF
19	Mr. Khan Durrani	Deputy Director	BOE
20	Mr. Hanif Rind	Deputy Director	Social Welfare
21	Mr. Zia Khilji	Dy. Director	Education
22	Mr. Abdul Hameed		FAO
23	Prof Dr Abdul Tawab	MD	BEF
24	Mr. Saeed Ahmed		FAO
25	Mr. Niamatullah	Director	Director RDA LGRDD
26	Ms. Rukhsana Ahmed	Member	NCSW
27	Dr. Barkat	Consultant	
28	Mr. Ishfaq Mengal	P.O	AF
29	Matiullah	D.C	IDO
30	Shauqat Kakar	P.M	IDO
31	M.J.Durrani	D.G.S.W.H.R	Social Welfare
32	Dr. Shaqufta	Principal	G.G.Degree College Jinnah Town Qta
33	Aisha Ali	Student	G.G.Degree College Jinnah Town Qta
34	Safia Wazir	Lecturer	SBKWU
35	Saadullah Baloch	RCO	RCO
36	Asif Ahmed	PIPS	IPSE
37	Akram Tareen	HOD(EEC)	SBKWU
38	Basit Ali	Admin Officer	AF
39	Abdul Ali	Internee	AF
40	Dr. Shakil Ghori	Consultant	AF

## Annex 7 Members of Research Team

### Members of Research Team and their Roles and Responsibilities

The team at Aurat Foundation, national and regional office contributed their input along with a team of short term consultants at different levels / processes involved to do this legislative/policy review and gap analysis. It involved technical backstopping, information acquisition for secondary literature review, developing initial framework for the study, coordination with stakeholders, field data search and data gathering from primary data sources and reproducing all information into report. Most prominently following team members get involved to produce the desired product/result;

Sr	Process details	Share of responsibilities
1	Development of initial research tool and framework	Uzma Zarrin, Director Programmes Ms. Sana Zeeshan, Manager ME, AF
2	Finalisation of Research Tools	Mr. Haroon Dawood, Resident Director, AF, Quetta Dr. Shakil Ghori, Dr. Zahoor Bazai, Ms. Nelofer Jamil (Short-term Consultants)
3	Finalization of stakeholders and coordination	AF, Regional Office, Quetta Team
4	Information acquisition for secondary literature review	Haroon Dawood, Resident Director, AF, and team of consultants
5	Gathering field data	Dr. Shakil Ghori supervising the field team i.e Mr. Ishfaq Mengal, Mr. Alluddin Khilji, Dr. Zahoor Bazai, Ms. Nelofer Jamil
6	Report writing	Dr. Shakil Ghori
7	Review comments, inputs and finalization	Team at UNDP and AF

## Annex 8 SDG 4 Targets

SDG 4 – Ensuring inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

### Outcome Targets

4.1 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and Goal-4 effective learning outcomes

The provision of 12 years of free, publicly-funded, inclusive, equitable, quality primary and secondary education – of which at least nine years are compulsory, leading to relevant learning outcomes – should be ensured for all, without discrimination.

4.2 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and preprimary education so that they are ready for primary education

The provision of at least one year of free and compulsory quality pre-primary education is encouraged, to be delivered by well-trained educators, as well as that of early childhood development and care.

4.3 By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable and quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university

It is imperative to reduce barriers to skills development and technical and vocational education and training (TVET), starting from the secondary level, as well as to tertiary education, including university, and to provide lifelong learning opportunities for youth and adults. The provision of tertiary education should be made progressively free, in line with existing international agreements.

4.4 By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship

1. Access: Equitable access to TVET needs to be expanded while quality is ensured. Learning opportunities should be increased and diversified, using a wide range of education and training modalities, so that all youth and adults, especially girls and women, can acquire relevant knowledge, skills and competencies for decent work and life.

2. Skills acquisition: Beyond work-specific skills, emphasis must be placed on developing high-level cognitive and non-cognitive/transferable skills, such as problem solving, critical thinking, creativity, teamwork, communication skills and conflict resolution, which can be used across a range of occupational fields. Moreover, learners should be provided with opportunities to update their skills continuously through lifelong learning.

4.5 By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations

1. Inclusion and equity: All people, irrespective of sex, age, race, colour, ethnicity, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property or birth, as well as persons with disabilities, migrants, indigenous peoples, and children and youth, especially those in vulnerable situations or other status, should have access to inclusive, equitable quality education and lifelong learning opportunities. Vulnerable groups that require particular attention and targeted strategies include persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples, ethnic minorities and the poor.
  2. Gender equality: All girls and boys, women and men, should have equal opportunity to enjoy education of high quality, achieve at equal levels and enjoy equal benefits from education. Adolescent girls and young women, who may be subject to gender-based violence, child marriage, early pregnancy and a heavy load of household chores, as well as those living in poor and remote rural areas, require special attention. In contexts in which boys are disadvantaged, targeted action should be taken for them. Policies aimed at overcoming gender inequality are more effective when they are part of an overall package that also promotes health, justice, good governance and freedom from child labour.
- 4.6 By 2030, ensure that all youth and a substantial proportion of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy

The principles, strategies and actions for this target are underpinned by the contemporary understanding of literacy as a continuum of proficiency levels in a given context. It goes beyond the understanding of a simple dichotomy of 'literate' versus 'illiterate'. Therefore, action for this target aims at ensuring that by 2030, all young people and adults across the world should have achieved relevant and recognized proficiency levels in functional literacy and numeracy skills that are equivalent to levels achieved at successful completion of basic education.

- 4.7 By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

It is vital to give a central place to strengthening education's contribution to the fulfilment of human rights, peace and responsible citizenship from local to global levels, gender equality, sustainable development and health. The content of such education must be relevant, with a focus on both cognitive and non-cognitive aspects of learning. The knowledge, skills, values and attitudes required by citizens to lead productive lives, make informed decisions and assume active roles locally and globally in facing and resolving global challenges can be acquired through education for sustainable development (ESD) and global citizenship education (GCED), which includes peace and human rights education, as well as intercultural education and education for international understanding.

### Means of Implementation

- 4a. Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, nonviolent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all.

This target addresses the need for adequate physical infrastructure and safe, inclusive environments that nurture learning for all, regardless of background or disability status.

- 4b. By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training and information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes, in developed countries and other developing countries.

Scholarship programmes can play a vital role in providing opportunities for young people and adults who would otherwise not be able to afford to continue their education. Where developed countries offer scholarships to students from developing countries, these should be structured to build the capability of the developing country. While the importance of scholarships is recognized, donor countries are encouraged to increase other forms of support to education. In line with the SDG4 -Education 2030 focus on equity, inclusion and quality, scholarships should be transparently targeted at young people from disadvantaged backgrounds.

- 4c. By 2030, substantially increase the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing states.

Teachers are the key to achieving all of the SDG4 targets. It requires urgent attention, with a more immediate deadline, because the equity gap in education is exacerbated by the shortage and uneven distribution of professionally trained teachers, especially in disadvantaged areas. As teachers are a fundamental condition for guaranteeing quality education, teachers and educators should be empowered, adequately recruited and remunerated, motivated, professionally qualified, and supported within well-resourced, efficient and effectively governed systems.







Aurat Publication & Information Service Foundation  
Building No.1, Street No.5 (OFF Jasmine Road), G-7/2, Islamabad  
Tel: +92-051-8318881-2, Website: [www.af.org.pk](http://www.af.org.pk)